

**EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
1 MAY 2014**

**A meeting of the Earthquake Recovery Committee of the Whole
was held in the Council Chamber
on 1 May 2014 at 9.34AM**

PRESENT: The Mayor, (Chairperson).
Councillors Vicki Buck, Jimmy Chen, Phil Clearwater, Pauline Cotter,
David East, Jamie Gough, Yani Johanson, Ali Jones, Raf Manji, Glenn
Livingstone, Paul Lonsdale and Andrew Turner

IN ATTENDANCE:

APOLOGIES: Tim Scandrett

The Committee reports that:

PART A - MATTERS REQUIRING A COUNCIL DECISION

(1.) ACTING CHIEF EXECUTIVE REPORT

The Committee considered a report from the Acting Chief Executive, including the following update on psychoactive substances.

PSYCHOACTIVE SUBSTANCES

The Government intends to ban all synthetic drugs within two weeks, unless they can be proven to be low risk. It is suggested that the effect of this will be that there will be no psychoactive substances for sale for "some considerable amount of time" (Minister's statement). However, the draft policy prepared for consultation includes a provision that exempts retailers from the need to comply with the policy anyway until such time as new Ministry of Health regulations (including a testing regime) are put in place, expected to be in mid 2015. This provision reflected one of the weaknesses exposed in recent days that the Act made the sale legal but that the anticipated health approval regime was not in place. The Minister's statement notes that in the interim, drugs which had temporary approval from an expert committee were permitted to be sold. This would indicate that some synthetic drugs will still be available and implies that others will be as well, once the testing regime is established. Therefore continuing with consultation on the draft policy makes sense in that its purpose is to control where approved substances can be sold. However, the public may find this confusing, so my recommendation is that the Council pause the further consultation until such time as it is clear whether trading in any substances can resume. This should reduce the potential for confusion in the public's mind given recent publicity.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

That the Council pause the release of its draft policy on psychoactive substances and further consultation until such time as the Government legislation on psychoactive substances has been amended.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

(2.) SUMNER ROAD REOPENING PROJECT

		Contact	Contact Details
Executive Leadership Team Member responsible:	General Manager, City Environment Group	N	
Officer responsible:	Unit Manager, Transport and Greenspace	Y	John Mackie DDI 941-8096
Author:	Paul Burden, Road Corridor Operations Manager	N	

1. PURPOSE AND ORIGIN OF REPORT

- 1.1 This report updates the Council on the Sumner Road Reopening Project and seeks endorsement of the proposed approach to risk mitigation in order to reopen the road to all users. A briefing for the Mayor and Councillor Paul Lonsdale was undertaken on this matter on Thursday 20 March 2014. At this briefing the Mayor confirmed that a decision is required from the Council to approve proceeding with this project.

2. EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

- 2.1 Sumner Road has been impacted significantly by rock fall as a result of the 2010/2011 earthquakes. The section of road between Evans Pass Road and Summit Road intersection and Lyttelton has been closed to all traffic since February 2011 due to large scale rock fall impacts with debris falling onto the road, and the presence of extensive earthquake induced instability on the slopes and cliff faces above the road. The slopes above the road are still considered to be at very high risk of rock fall.
- 2.2 Sumner Road provides a lifeline route, linking the communities of Lyttelton and Sumner, and it is the preferred route for transport of over-dimensioned and hazardous goods between Lyttelton Port and the city.
- 2.3 The reopening of Sumner Road is included in the Land Use Recovery Plan, the Greater Christchurch Transport Statement and the Christchurch City Council Three Year Plan.

3. BACKGROUND

- 3.1 Prior to the 4 September 2010 earthquake, some scaling (removal of loose rocks) was in progress along Sumner Road. The 4 September earthquake resulted in scattered rock falls along Sumner Road with significant falls occurring in the road batter above Battery Point. The road was closed for three months while remediation work was undertaken to remove unstable rock and clear loose rock over a length of around 150 metres and at a cost of approximately \$1 million. Observations revealed several large potential rock fall hazards along the road and more detailed assessment of these was scheduled when the 22 February event occurred.
- 3.2. The 22 February 2011 earthquake resulted in widespread rock fall and closure of Sumner Road, which still remains closed. In some locations the road surface was totally covered by fallen rock, and there was new serious damage to the road batter at Windy Point. The road surface in this area was buried under up to two metres of debris. Work was undertaken to remove unstable rock at Windy Point at a cost of approximately \$2.75 million. Inspections of the cliffs revealed much more loose rock present along the cliffs than there was in September. Work began to scale the obvious loose rock with a view to reducing the risk of rock fall and reopening the road.
- 3.3. The events of 13 June 2011 resulted in extensive rock fall from the bluffs on a scale at least as great as 22 February, even in those areas where scaling had recently been completed. Re-inspection showed that the areas previously considered stable had actually now fallen or, in many cases, were badly damaged and now very unstable. Staff made the decision to halt all remedial works pending further investigations concerning the future of the road.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

- 3.4. A route options study and multi-criteria assessment was carried out to determine whether or not the road should be reopened (refer **Attachment 1**). The preferred option was to reopen the road with a do-minimum approach to works. Subsequent field investigation and risk assessments have produced a recommended engineering approach to the risk mitigation works. The recommended risk mitigation works are consistent with the do-minimum approach and consist of source rock deconstruction, construction of two bunds and some benching of the Crater Rim Bluffs.

4. COMMENT

- 4.1 The reopening of Sumner Road is included in the Land Use Recovery Plan, the Greater Christchurch Transport Statement and the Christchurch City Council Three Year Plan.
- 4.2 The road corridor from Ferrymead Bridge to Lyttelton has been affected by rock fall and cliff collapse resulting from the earthquake events of September 2010, February 2011 and June 2011. This report deals with the first section of the corridor, Sumner Road.
- 4.3 Although the majority of the roads forming this corridor have been able to be cleared of debris and have in some cases had interim rock fall protection structures in the form of ballasted shipping containers in place to enable access and local traffic movements, the section of Sumner Road between Lyttelton and Evans Pass has been closed to full vehicle operation since February 2011.
- 4.4 Four sections of the corridor have been identified (refer **Attachment 2**) which require major source rock risk mitigation works, in order to address ongoing rock fall hazards and allow the route to return to its pre-quake Level of Service. These four sections of the corridor are:
- 4.4.1 Section 1: Sumner Road (Lyttelton to Evans Pass)
 - 4.4.2 Section 2: Wakefield Avenue
 - 4.4.3 Section 3: Shag Rock Reserve (Peacocks Gallop)
 - 4.4.4 Section 4: Moa Bone Point
- 4.5 Sumner Road through Evans Pass is a lifeline route. Should for any reason the road tunnel become inoperable then the route out of Lyttelton is significantly compromised. Part of the Sumner Road life line route includes Wakefield Avenue and Main Road. There are significant rock fall risks associated with Moa Bone Point, Peacocks Gallop and Wakefield Avenue that also threaten the operation of this route as a reliable lifeline. It follows that, in terms of the risks to the lifeline and associated costs of remediation, the Sumner Road rock fall issues are inextricably linked to the rock fall issues along the balance of the route.
- 4.6 Sumner Road was the most efficient and preferred route for over dimension and dangerous goods vehicles between the Lyttelton Port and Christchurch. Dangerous goods are not permitted through the road tunnel unless it is closed to all other traffic. Over dimension vehicles cannot use the tunnel unless the opposing traffic lane is closed to all other vehicles. Therefore prior to Sumner Road being closed, these vehicles used Evans Pass. Since the closure of Sumner Road some over dimension vehicles are using Gebbies Pass and Dyers Pass, some are using the Port of Timaru and some are still using the road tunnel (requiring closure of the opposing lane). Prior to the earthquakes, the tunnel was being closed four to five times per month and this has increased to approximately 300 closures per month with each closure lasting approximately 10 minutes. In addition, single lane closures for some over dimension vehicles amount to an average of around 80 per month. The significant number of closures impact on the optimisation of freight operations and has a flow on effect on driver rostering and servicing of customers.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

Lyttelton Port Company (LPC) Operations

- 4.7 The rock fall source above the main bluffs not only poses a risk to Sumner Road but also the 'Lower Sumner Road' which provides access to the LPC quarry at Gollans Bay. The quarry is integral to the LPC operations providing armour stone for seawalls. There is potential for loss of land due to wave induced washout without adequate sea wall protection. Access to the quarry is currently suspended until adequate protection from rock fall can be established.
- 4.8 The inability to take some over dimension and dangerous goods to and from Christchurch via Sumner Road has resulted in some diversion of these goods through Timaru. This has the potential for lost revenue through the Port and the local Lyttelton township.
- 4.9 The closure of Sumner Road results in an inevitable loss of tourist and recreational trade in both Sumner and Lyttelton.
- 4.10 Traffic volumes for Sumner Road appear to fluctuate on a seasonal basis with around 1,400 vehicles per day in the summer and around 1,000 vehicles per day in the winter. It is uncertain what percentage of these volumes is associated with tourists, however anecdotally it is likely to be significant. The views from various vantage points along the road are spectacular and the permanent closure of the road will be a loss to the tourism industry as well as the resident community.
- 4.11 It is estimated that on a weekend day in the summer around 200 cyclists would be using this route in a recreational/training capacity. The route across Evans Pass has been integral to the cycling community in terms of providing the linkage between Lyttelton and Sumner for both the traditional 'long bays' and 'short bays' rides and races. The Port Hills are considered one of the best road cycling hill training areas in the world and the loss of the ability to use Sumner Road/Evans Pass significantly compromises this.

Stakeholders

- 4.12 The Department of Conservation (DoC) is the landowner responsible for most of the material that has damaged the road. The most imminent source rock hazards, including the Crater Rim Bluffs are located on DoC land.
 - 4.12.1 Christchurch City Council owns the road and some land.
 - 4.12.2 LPC owns land above and below Sumner Road.
 - 4.12.3 Environment Canterbury (ECan) administers relevant environmental legislation (in addition to the Christchurch City Council).
 - 4.12.4 Christchurch Earthquake Recovery Authority (CERA) has accountability for economic recovery.
 - 4.12.5 New Zealand Transport Agency (NZTA) is the road controlling authority for the State Highway network including the road tunnel.
 - 4.12.6 Residents and business owners and occupiers are affected by any option.
 - 4.12.7 **Attachment 3** shows the land areas and land owners in the vicinity of Sumner Road.
- 4.13 Options for reopening Sumner Road have been compared with the upgrade of alternative routes over the Port Hills and the construction of a new road. This comparison has confirmed that the reopening of Sumner Road is the preferred solution and the previous Council has made a financial commitment to this in the Three Year Plan.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

- 4.14 The option selected returns the road to a pre-quake status without betterment. The scope of the roading portion of the project is limited to repair of the road assets and does not include betterment in terms of widening the road or adding other features.
- 4.15 The options that were considered prior to the inclusion of funds in the Three Year Plan are:
- 4.15.1 Close Sumner Road and Dyers Pass Upgrade
 - 4.15.2 Close Sumner Road and Gebbies Pass Upgrade
 - 4.15.3 Close Sumner Road and New Road (Chapmans Rd – Cass Bay)
 - 4.15.4 Close Sumner Road and Do Nothing (over dimension and dangerous goods through Port Timaru)
 - 4.15.5 Open Sumner Road and Rock Shelter
 - 4.15.6 Open Sumner Road and Rock Containment Mesh and rock bolting
 - 4.15.7 Open Sumner Road and Clear Debris and Remediate Road Surface
 - 4.15.8 Open Sumner Road and Excavation to Create Benching of Bluffs.
- 4.16 A multi-criteria assessment tool was developed to evaluate the options. The tool weighs the options against the project objectives, environmental objectives and costs. The weightings were developed through a robust workshop process with key staff. To add further integrity sensitivity testing was conducted. Full details of the criteria, measure, explanation and scoring can be found in the report produced by BECA Infrastructure (refer **Attachment 1**).
- 4.17 The Project has progressed this previous route options work with detailed site investigations and a series of qualitative slope risk assessments. This work has identified a recommended engineering approach which is a combination of source rock deconstruction, bunds and some benching to mitigate the rock fall risk and enable the reopening of Sumner Road. This is a do-minimum approach to return the route to its pre-quake level of service with a minimum of future maintenance.
- 4.18 Evaluation of actual and potential risk is an important consideration. Various roads within the city have been exposed historically to risk from rock fall arising from weather or time related effects. Since the earthquakes, rock fall sources were either mobilised (rocks falling onto the road), or were weakened (joints opening up, blocks of rock separating but not falling). The result is an increased risk of rock fall in the future, either from future earthquake shaking or weather or time effects.
- 4.19 In New Zealand at present the only method in place for assessing the risk from rock fall is an 'as low a risk as practicable' ('ALARP') process adopted by the NZTA. The Council's external peer reviewer on rock fall matters, Dr Fred Baynes, advised that the New South Wales (NSW) Road Transport Authority (RTA) method of rock fall risk analysis is a better method because of practicality and ease and consistency of use, and recommended that the Council should consider adopting it for use on roads at risk from rock fall in the future.
- 4.20 The Council has applied a variant of the NSW RTA method, called the Designation and Detailed Slope Risk Assessment (DDSRA), which has been developed by Aurecon, and tested in the Port Hills post-quake, for the re-opening of Evans Pass and Summit Roads for alternative access to Sumner. The Aurecon DDSRA method is a qualitative assessment which results in rapid repeatable risk assessments for roads which are subject to geotechnical hazards post-quake risk and enables the effective prioritisation of hazards.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

- 4.21 A slope risk assessment has been completed and engineering concepts for the mitigation of risk from geotechnical hazards has been developed. The details of the risk assessments and engineering options is detailed in the Sumner Road Stage 3 Concept Design Report (refer **Attachment 4**).

Proposed Engineering Approach

- 4.22 Risk mitigation works for geotechnical hazards have been split into two broad zones. Zone A includes more straight forward remedial works, at either end of the road, comprising scaling and limited blasting. Zone B covers the central section of the site and includes the 100m high Crater Rim Bluffs. Major earthworks in the form of benches, are considered to be the only viable option to significantly reduce risk levels in this area. (refer **Attachment 5**).
- 4.23 Investigative drilling work (three inclined bores to 140 metres and one vertical bore to 80 metres) behind the Crater Rim Bluffs are currently being drilled to inform the scope and method for benching. This will provide base data for the progression of the benching design and subsequent tender.
- 4.24 Rock material removed from the site will be stored for future use (potentially in the order of 1M m³ and possibly in the Gollans Bay Quarry). Minimal disturbance and disruption to the residents of Lyttelton Harbour and Sumner/Redcliffs areas is a priority.
- 4.25 Once the geotechnical works are underway and sections of the road are cleared as safe for contractor access the asset repair team will start the assessment and design for the repair of the roading assets. The asset repair construction works are expected to take approximately 18 months. It is expected that the proposed work will start as soon as consents are obtained in 2014 with the road open at the end of 2016.

CONSULTATION

- 4.26 Initial discussions have been held with LPC and NZTA to understand the issues they have with the potential closure of Sumner Road. A project update workshop for CERA, NZTA and LPC was held on 15 January 2014.
- 4.27 The project team, in conjunction with Christchurch City Council and ECan planning staff, have identified DoC, Ngäi Tahu, Ngäti Wheke, LPC and Community Boards as parties with an interest in the project. These parties are considered to be those that can provide comments on the community, economic, and environmental effects that pertain to the construction, and post-construction phase of the project.
- 4.28 Meetings have taken place with DoC, Ngäti Wheke and Ngäi Tahu. They are all supportive of the project and associated consent application. Both Rünunga have given written confirmation of their support of the project.
- 4.29 The Summit Road Protection Authority is supportive of the application and has given their written approval for the project.
- 4.30 LPC - There was a positive response to the engineering approach proposed by the project. Regular meetings are being held with LPC to discuss operational aspects of the Gollans Bay Quarry. A Memorandum of Understanding will be developed to support the relationship.
- 4.31 The Christchurch City Council and CERA keep up to date through the Horizontal Infrastructure Governance Group and Lyttelton Recovery Planning Steering Group.
- 4.32 The Project team has had ongoing discussions with NZTA since the workshop and have now reached the point where NZTA has confirmed its support for the project approach.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

2 Cont'd

- 4.33 Public Consultation - In addition to consulting with the affected parties listed above, the project team propose to release a Public Information Leaflet (PIL) (refer **Attachment 6**) to provide the public with an update on the project and an opportunity to comment on the proposed works, prior to the lodgement of the consent application. During the processing of the consent there will be a second phase of public consultation which is managed by the Regulatory Authorities (ECan and the Christchurch City Council).
- 4.34 The project team have received internal and external legal advice on the consents required for this work. There are no legal issues associated with the progression of the project.

Schedule

- 4.35 The geotechnical works required to mitigate the risk from source rock hazards is expected to take in the order of 18 months to complete and will be followed by the roading repair works, which will also take around 18 months. The geotech and roading works will be overlapped where possible (once upslope hazards are eliminated). At this stage the works are targeted for completion by end 2016.
- 4.36 Physical works cannot begin until the required resource consents are obtained from the Christchurch City Council and ECan. The consent application cannot be lodged until the public consultation phase is completed. Delays to the public consultation phase of the project will result in a corresponding delay in the consenting and subsequent physical works phases.

5. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 5.1 The overall budget for the restoration of the road corridor from Ferrymead bridge to Lyttelton is included in the Council's Three Year Plan as \$102.5 million, of this \$40 million has been identified as being required for the Sumner Road section of the route.
- 5.2 The Christchurch City Council Three Year Plan funds are limited to the return to pre-quake Level of Service. The budgets do not include any allowance for betterment. The restoration of the road is provided for in the Infrastructure Rebuild Programme.

6. STAFF RECOMMENDATION

That the Council:

- 6.1 Endorse the progression of the project with the proposed approach being 'do minimum source rock deconstruction to mitigate Geotechnical hazards and return route to pre-quake Level of Service'.
- 6.2 Endorse the initiation of the public engagement phase of the communications and consultation strategy by approving the release of the Public Information Leaflet and a Media statement.

COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

That the staff recommendation be adopted.

(3.) LAND USE RECOVERY PLAN – ACTION 33 - CHRISTCHURCH CITY COUNCIL'S PRIORITISED INFRASTRUCTURE PROGRAMMES

This item was considered by the Council on 8 May 2014.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

(4.) LAND USE RECOVERY PLAN. ACTION 7: POTENTIAL MECHANISMS FOR PROMOTING INTENSIFICATION AND CITY LIVING

This item was considered by the Council on 8 May 2014.

(5.) AN ACCESSIBLE CITY – REVISED FIRST PHASE TRANSPORT PROJECTS

This item was considered by the Council on 8 May 2014.

(6.) THE COUNCIL'S ROLE IN AFFORDABLE/SOCIAL HOUSING AND SUPPLEMENTARY REPORT

This item was considered at the extraordinary Council meeting on 12 May 2014.

(7.) LAND USE RECOVERY PLAN: EVALUATION OF CHRISTCHURCH CITY COUNCIL EXEMPLAR HOUSING PROJECTS

This item was considered by the Council on 8 May 2014.

PART B - REPORTS FOR INFORMATION

(1. CONT'D) ACTING CHIEF EXECUTIVE REPORT

The Committee considered a report from the Acting Chief Executive, which included the following topics:

- Flooding taskforce
- Struthers Lane
- Majestic Theatre update
- Red zone revaluations
- Answers to questions asked at Council meetings.
- Rebuild and recovery.

It was noted that:

- the current rates remission policies, which were developed to assist residents with earthquake damaged properties, are not directly applicable to households affected by flooding, however the Council recognises the need to assist these households
- the Council Rates Remission Policy has a provision that the Council can, by specific resolution, remit any rate or rates penalty when it considers it just and equitable to do so.

It was **decided** to request a report from staff, for a Council decision by the end of May 2014, with the report to include the following:

- criteria for rates remission to apply to households affected by flooding or land movements caused by flooding
- advice regarding the potential timing for the implementation of such criteria.

It was **decided** to ratify the decision of the Acting Chief Executive to extend the due date for objections to rating valuations by ten working days, which takes it to 12 May 2014. Refer to item 20 of this agenda.

(8.) DEPUTATIONS BY APPOINTMENT

8.1 Heathcote Flooding - Graham Walker and Roger Kershaw

Messers Walker and Kershaw spoke to the Committee regarding flooding of the Heathcote River.

EARTHQUAKE RECOVERY COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE 1. 5. 2014

8 Cont'd

8.2 Robert White

Mr White spoke to the Committee regarding the alignment of Stronger Christchurch Infrastructure Rebuild Team (SCIRT) works with the City Plan and the Transport Plan.

The Mayor thanked the presenters for their deputations.

(9.) PRESENTATIONS

Nil.

PART C - REPORT ON DELEGATED DECISIONS TAKEN BY THE COMMITTEE

(10.) APOLOGIES

It was **resolved** to accept an apology for absence from Councillor Tim Scandrett.

(11.) DECLARATION OF INTEREST

Nil.

(12.) RESOLUTION TO BE PASSED - SUPPLEMENTARY REPORTS

It was **resolved** that the following reports and information be received and considered at the meeting of the Earthquake Recovery Committee of the Whole on 1 May 2014:

- The Acting Chief Executive Report.
- Canterbury Earthquake Memorial.

Due to time constraints, it was **decided** to forward the public excluded report on the Canterbury Earthquake Memorial to the Council meeting of 8 May 2014 for consideration.

The meeting concluded at 1.53pm.

CONSIDERED THIS 22ND DAY OF MAY 2014

MAYOR